#### BEFORE THE ARIZONA MEDICAL BOARD

In the Matter of

### MARTIN CHATTMAN, M.D.

License No. 7618
For the Practice of Allopathic Medicine
In the State of Arizona.

Case No. MD-09-1532A

# ORDER FOR PROBATION AND CONSENT TO THE SAME CONSENT

Martin Chattman, M.D. ("Respondent") elects to permanently waive any right to a hearing and appeal with respect to this Order for Letter of Reprimand and Probation; admits the jurisdiction of the Arizona Medical Board ("Board"); and consents to the entry of this Order by the Board.

#### FINDINGS OF FACT

- 1. The Board is the duly constituted authority for the regulation and control of the practice of allopathic medicine in the State of Arizona.
- 2. Respondent is the holder of license number 7618 for the practice of allopathic medicine in the State of Arizona.
- 3. The Board initiated case number MD-09-1532A after Board staff conducted a chart review pursuant to Respondent's June 3, 2009 Board Order for a Letter of Reprimand and Probation that included periodic chart reviews. Two patients' charts were reviewed for case MD-09-1532A, 73 year-old female patient ("SL") and 75 year-old female patient ("MC").
- 4. Respondent first treated patient SL on October 1, 2009 when she presented with the complaints of weight check, allergy and eye pain. Respondent did not review SL's systems. Respondents' exam of SL showed a normal blood pressure, clear heart/lungs, and eyelid edema. Respondent ordered a thyroid exam, which showed a marked decrease in thyroid-stimulating hormone. Respondent saw SL again on October 28, 2009, and Respondent documented that SL felt great and her clothes were fitting better.

. 

Respondent did not perform a review of systems. Respondent saw SL again three additional times without documenting assessments, current medications, or known allergies.

- 5. Respondent began treating patient MC on October 2, 2009 with the complaints of numb fingers, carpal tunnel syndrome for one week, and pain in the wrist. Respondent did not perform an exam of MC, nor a review of systems. A hormone lab profile from December 2009 showed normal estrogen and progesterone levels, with a low testosterone level. Respondent saw MC in follow up and ordered several labs. Respondent prescribed Vesicare, Cymbalta, and Norvasc without any documentation in MC's chart. Respondent also failed to adequately treat MC's hypertension.
- 6. The standard of care requires the physician's evaluation of the patient to be organized and symptom specific.
- 7. Respondent deviated from the standard of care by failing to conduct examinations for MC and SL's complaints of abdominal pain and numb fingers.
- 8. The standard of care when conducting an eye exam for the patient's complaint of a painful eye requires a physician to inspect the cornea, iris and anterior chamber, or refer the patient to an eye specialist.
- 9. Respondent deviated from the standard of care by failing to examine SL's iris, cornea, or refer her to an eye specialist.
- 10. The standard of care requires a physician to adequately treat the patient's hypertension in a patient with persistently high blood pressure.
- Respondent deviated from the standard of care by failing to adequately treat
   MC's hypertension.
- 12. Respondent could have potentially caused harm when performing an incomplete eye exam as the health of that end-organ is jeopardized to loss. Respondent

placed himself in the realm of poor choices in the diagnostic arena and could open insurance investigations into over-charging with such small symptom dissection. A stroke or myocardial infarct could have occurred in MC, whose elevated blood pressure was taken on three different dates. An abdominal catastrophe could have occurred with abdominal pain.

13. As a result of this matter, Respondent was ordered to undergo Phase I and II of the Physician Assessment and Clinical Education (PACE) Evaluation. Respondent completed the PACE Evaluation on September 3, 2010. PACE determined that Respondent has a sufficient fund of knowledge, but appears to be overlooking important details in his exam and treatment of patients.

## **CONCLUSIONS OF LAW**

- The Board possesses jurisdiction over the subject matter hereof and over Respondent.
- 2. The conduct and circumstances described above constitute unprofessional conduct pursuant to A.R.S. § 32-1401(27)(q) ("[a]ny conduct or practice that is or might be harmful or dangerous to the health of the patient or the public").

#### **ORDER**

#### IT IS HEREBY ORDERED THAT:

- 1. Respondent is issued an Order of Probation.
- 2. Respondent is placed on probation for **one year** with the following terms and conditions:
- a. Within **thirty days** of the effective date of the Order, Respondent shall enter into a contract with a Board approved monitoring company to provide all monitoring services and Respondent shall be responsible for all monitoring costs.

	1	
	2	
	3	
	4	
	5	
	6	
	7	
	8	
	9	
1	0	
1	1	
1	2	
1	3	
1	4	
1	5	
1	6	
1	7	
1	R	

20

21

22

23

24

25

#### b. Chart Reviews

The Monitor shall perform biannual chart reviews.

#### c. Tolling

In the event Respondent should leave Arizona to reside or practice outside the State or for any reason should Respondent stop practicing medicine in Arizona, Respondent shall notify the Executive Director in writing within ten days of departure and return or the dates of non-practice within Arizona. Non-practice is defined as any period of time exceeding thirty days during which Respondent is not engaging in the practice of medicine. Periods of temporary or permanent residence or practice outside Arizona or of non-practice within Arizona, will not apply to the reduction of the probationary period.

(SEAL)



ARIZONA MEDICAL BOARD

Lisa S. Wynn
Executive Director

# **CONSENT TO ENTRY OF ORDER**

- 1. Respondent has read and understands this Consent Agreement and the stipulated Findings of Fact, Conclusions of Law and Order ("Order"). Respondent acknowledges he has the right to consult with legal counsel regarding this matter.
- 2. Respondent acknowledges and agrees that this Order is entered into freely and voluntarily and that no promise was made or coercion used to induce such entry.

- 3. By consenting to this Order, Respondent voluntarily relinquishes any rights to a hearing or judicial review in state or federal court on the matters alleged, or to challenge this Order in its entirety as issued by the Board, and waives any other cause of action related thereto or arising from said Order.
- 4. The Order is not effective until approved by the Board and signed by its Executive Director.
- 5. All admissions made by Respondent are solely for final disposition of this matter and any subsequent related administrative proceedings or civil litigation involving the Board and Respondent. Therefore, said admissions by Respondent are not intended or made for any other use, such as in the context of another state or federal government regulatory agency proceeding, civil or criminal court proceeding, in the State of Arizona or any other state or federal court.
- 6. Upon signing this agreement, and returning this document (or a copy thereof) to the Board's Executive Director, Respondent may not revoke the consent to the entry of the Order. Respondent may not make any modifications to the document. Any modifications to this original document are ineffective and void unless mutually approved by the parties.
- 7. This Order is a public record that will be publicly disseminated as a formal disciplinary action of the Board and will be reported to the National Practitioner's Data Bank and on the Board's web site as a disciplinary action.
- 8. If any part of the Order is later declared void or otherwise unenforceable, the remainder of the Order in its entirety shall remain in force and effect.
- 9. If the Board does not adopt this Order, Respondent will not assert as a defense that the Board's consideration of the Order constitutes bias, prejudice, prejudgment or other similar defense.

1	10. Any violation of this Order constitutes unprofessional conduct and may result	
2	in disciplinary action. A.R.S. § § 32-1401(27)(r) ("[v]iolating a formal order, probation,	
3	consent agreement or stipulation issued or entered into by the board or its executive	
4	director under this chapter") and 32-1451.	
5	11. Respondent has read and understands the conditions of probation.	
6- 7 8	MARTIN CHATTMAN, M.D.  DATED: 12-29-10	
9		
10	EXECUTED COPy of the foregoing mailed	
11	11.11.11.11.11.11.11.11.11.11.11.11.11.	
12	Martin Chattman, M.D. Address of Record	
13		
14	ORIGINAL of the foregoing filed this / Day of / Julian 2010 with:	
15	Arizona Medical Board	
16	9545 E. Doubletree Ranch Road Scottsdale, AZ 85258	
17		
18	Arizona Medical Board Staff	
19	Arizona Medicai Board Stan	
20		
21		
22		
23		